

CHRMAP Community Workshop – Peppermint Grove Beach

Tuesday 2nd May 2023 – 5:00pm – 7:00pm

Attendees: Approx 80 + Karl Illich, Matthew, Gordon, Matt, Scott, Craig Perry, Cr McCleery, Cr Mogg, Cr Terrantroy

Apologies – Cr Kitchen, Cr Noonan,

Gordon - Welcome and Acknowledgement to Country

Questions & Comments

Economic

Question: Hitting the residents with a \$1400/year levy will result in the price of houses going down and insurances will be impacted.

Karl Illich: Insurance are unlikely to change because currently any damage from the sea generally isn't covered. Where this process has been started on the East Coast, a drop in house prices hasn't been evident to date.

Question: The suggested necessary money is going to cost \$1400/year/house for 15 years, there is no moral reason that this can't be spread across 100 years and spread to future ratepayers. More specifically, we're all nervous about dollar value as others will be benefitting for 100 years to protect this residential area.

Karl Illich: This is the first step for State Government to consider a \$\$ value. This information is required to move forward. There have been 20-30 CHRMAP's across WA with no timeframe of equity and no Act in WA which covers this. This assumes that parcel holders pay however the State & Local Governments will explore alternatives.

Question: The fundamental issue, and we could argue all night about the impact, that this report infers that Peppermint Grove Beach is at risk and the inclusion of draft suggestion of the \$1400 levy will actually be totally ineffective and Shire of Capel & State Government are the ones that approved this subdivision and we should not have a historical penalty. If there was a new development, then you could advise new landowners and include the additional penalty rate.

Gordon MacMile: In the pilot program, it assumed that responsibility lay with parcel owner but there has been no discussion about how it should/could be shared with other shire ratepayers.

Karl Illich – This is not a recommendation. As an example, the City of Busselton have created a slush fund for future coastal issues.

Question: Given the uncertainty of the situation we've been looking at, why was there a figure put in the report in the first place? Makes me wonder about the underlying scope of what was given.

Karl Illich – Including the economics was part of our scope and the State Departments.

Question: Peppermint Grove Beach is only town in the Shire of Capel getting charged a levy, there is nothing for other areas.

Gordon MacMile & Karl Illich – There is an included cost for Dalyellup but there is for erosion, not inundation like Peppermint Grove Beach. There is around \$20000 per impacted home per year.

Comment: This is about money and is why everyone is here. If you need the Geotech data and it costs money, then it needs to be done in order to have all the evidence and put it in the recommendations. If State and Local Governments haven't contributed, then they need to.

Question: Thank you for the presentation but why can't the Shire of Capel pre-empt and say we are not going to adopt and enforce the charges? Why are you not saying there is currently no plan to enforce this levy on landowners?

Gordon MacMile: As Shire of Capel officer and the CEO I can say that in 2 or 3 months a report will go to council to accept the report but the officer recommendation will not be to add a levy or increase rates.

Question: Who's making the decision to come up with amount for levy over 15 years?

Gordon MacMile: The State Government will.

Karl Illich: The State Government want to know the impact to private, local, State Government assets and communities. We gave information to an economic consultant who has used the 15 years as standard previously. Rates discussion has come about as rates are how Local Governments generate income.

Question: How accurate would the levy figure be? Is the system that generated that figure correct?

Karl Illich: There is more detail in an appendix to report. The system provides a rough guide as it only counts land parcels. This was just one example which came up with the \$1400. There are other options which looks at State Government, Shire of Capel and ratepayers input.

Question: Any chance of this fee being implemented to all ratepayers?

Gordon MacMile: Yes, it's an option but that depends on the decision from Council. It's about the usability of the location and others that benefit from the area. We hear the exact same comments from Dalyellup regarding their specified area rating.

Other

Comment: There have been 3 cyclones - 1978, 1990, 1995 and every time following storm damage, the sand has been naturally replenished up to the primary dune, not secondary dunes

Question: One fixture along Peppermint Grove Beach which doesn't move is the guard rail fence that was put in near Robinson's farm. The sand level drops 2 metres but the water level doesn't change even at high tide.

Karl Illich: This area was stable originally with the patches of reef offshore which is consistent with other stable nodes along the coastline. And regular monitoring is key which is why the policy states it.

Comment: We bought our block in 1966 and moved in, in 1978. At that time, we installed a wooden walkway down to beach which lasted a while and then installed a cement one. The walkway is still the same and the sand dunes go and come back and this is over 45 years of history.

Question: Who controls the beach area, the Shire of Capel or State Government?

Gordon MacMile: It's different for different areas. The Shire of Capel manages the foreshore.

Comment: In the State Government Planning policy, around sea level planning, it has previously stated that the coastal change between now and 2100 is 0.38m sea level rise but that has since changed to 0.9m rise. The Shire of Capel should say to State Government that they need to review their science.

Question: We have the Harvey, Dardanup and Bunbury Local Government's included but why isn't Busselton included?

Karl Illich and Gordon MacMile: Busselton have another consultant for their project but we will be taking a collaborative approach with neighbouring local governments.

Question: The Shire of Capel & Karl is painting Peppermint Grove Beach as 'black dog'. All councils have 'black dog' but we are a 'blacker dog'. Proposed levy, whatever they might be and wherever they come from - will the bucket of money be available and fit for purpose when its needed or will it go into a Shire of Capel/State Government black hole? There is no guarantee that whatever levy I put in, the money will be used specifically for this.

Gordon MacMile: No answers to funding questions as we have had a chance to investigate and implement. In terms of the 'black dog' concern, that is not the picture that is intended to be painted. As Karl explained earlier, the project is broken into units and Peppermint Grove Beach is incredibly different to other coastal location. No intent to paint Peppermint Grove Beach in any way and the only similar neighbour is up to Stratham with low lying river at the back. The report objectively looks at physical categories on map etc and caters for the unique environment with unique challenges.

Question: We've heard that the Shire will probably note the report but I'm concerned that the report doesn't have the historical evidence that these local residents have. A key recommendation in here is to collect additional Geotech data which has additional costs. Those erosion lines assume sand but we need to look further and it requires additional monitoring.

Karl Illich: In these early stages there's extensive consultation that needs to be undertaken, and it's fair to say that we can't put a dollar value on this now. There will be a series of recommendations and council will need to adopt those recommendations with no levy added. In order for any levy to be put in place it would require additional consultation.

Gordon MacMile: One recommendation will be putting some money aside to develop a Foreshore Management Plan to include monitoring. The usual process in terms of rating increases - there has to be a 21-day consultation period. Additionally, if a rate was levied for a specific purpose, the money then has to be saved by Council and spent on that purpose which is audited by Office of Auditor General.

Question: Have you done this survey on other areas around the state? Have you come up with figures for other communities, in terms of dollars? If someone was here from the press then it becomes a news story around levy. If there were 6 - 10 other locations in the same situation then it's clear that it's across the entire state, not just Peppermint Grove Beach.

Karl Illich: I have worked on 15 of these projects and this is the first project with \$\$\$. There is one more considering the dollar component.

Question: You mentioned that state planning are going to add '100 year flood' on Titles - this is going to affect house prices in Peppermint Grove Beach and nowhere else in the Shire of Capel. What stage of this plan are they looking at doing it? And what houses will it be applied to - beachside or whole community?

Karl Illich: Planning recommendation covers whatever is affected displayed in maps by erosion lines and flooding areas. The triggers are different between the two. Your other key point around market values is unknown at this stage as its early days. However, the East Coast is about 20-30 years ahead of us and there have been no known issues around market value.

Comment: Thank you, it was a good presentation. We can see that the State Government and Shire of Capel are taking steps to understand the coastal risks of the area and it's a shame that the economics detracts from that message. The key for me is that there are some areas at risk and some things that need to be done and the application of the economics has taken away from focus which has meant some people haven't taken key risks onboard.

Question: My property is 19/20 metres above sea level and I pay flood insurance which is a waste of money. The only thing we're being asked to contribute to is the road leading out of Peppermint Grove beach, that's the only thing that's going to affect us as far as inundation and erosion.

Gordon MacMile: There is also the toilet block, playground and carpark that are at risk public assets which will incur potential local government costs.

Question: Has the Shire of Capel set aside money for this?

Gordon MacMile: Currently we don't have a reserve and it is a decision for council about setting one in the future. And Council will also need to make decisions for funds allocation in future budgets.

Question: One of the slides you showed had 4 different time periods, in the 2020 column both residential and commercial land was at extreme risk. Can you please explain the basis on those ratings?

Karl Illich: Using Albany as an example the erosion line is similar to what we've been working through tonight. With a 2017 erosion line, the likelihood at erosion at 2017 is 'possible'. We don't want to plan around 'impact', it allows local and State Governments to plan and implement changes within the zone of risk. This is a conservative approach based on the planning policy.

Question: What is future work that is being done?

Gordon MacMile: No decision as yet.

Question: Do we have an expectation of what our beach front will look like? Similar to the groynes in Busselton?

Karl Illich: The key recommendation for erosion is to purchase houses before they erode but there are multiple options/planning discussions. We haven't recommended bringing in rocks or to build groynes.

Question: If we're really true to this then the council needs to look at how it's spending money now. The Hardy Tce carpark is eroding into the sand dunes and requires drainage repairs.

Tanya Gillett: The Hardy Tce carpark is planned for next financial year, 2023/2024.

Question: Are there things that the community can do to protect the dunes?

Karl Illich: The development of a Foreshore Management Plan and community education around keeping them healthy.

Gordon MacMile: I can guarantee that a Foreshore Management Plan will be a recommendation to council.

Question: Do cars have an impact on dunes?

Karl Illich/Gordon MacMile: Varied impact across all areas but is a contributing factor.

Gordon MacMile to close:

This is a study driven by the State Government with the Shire of Capel making decisions around adopting the report. This is open for public comment until the 19th May. After that date all submissions will be reviewed and Water Tech and Peron Naturaliste Partnership will finalise the report. All Local Governments will review and discuss with their Councillors where they will outline some logical next steps to start the process.

Peron Naturaliste Partnership - [Archives: Projects | Peron Naturaliste](#)